

FM REVIEW COMMENTS 2013 24

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: This essay discusses whether patients' and colleagues' ignorance, assumptions, and insensitivity qualify as racism in the view of this Indian FMG. I'm perfectly happy to send the essay out for review; however, my recommendation is to reject and invite the author to resubmit. In my read, there is no particular story here, although there are allusions to personal experiences. I would encourage the author to frame her thoughts around a central story, perhaps describing a specific interaction with a patient or colleague that reveals more of her own reactions.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: The narrative essay section of the journal looks for submissions that tell personal stories that emphasize reflection, insight, and growth. The policy of the journal is not to publish essays that represent an individual's thoughts or opinions about various topics. In our read, your essay, while raising important issues both about racism and about biases against international medical graduates, does not tell a story. There is no central narrative organizing your thoughts and questions. We encourage you to consider rewriting the essay so that it offers the reader a compelling and involving story about an instance where you have felt judged by colleagues because of where you were educated; or about an encounter with patients or colleagues in which you experienced ignorant, prejudiced, or insensitive remarks. Tell us how these events affected you; show us how they shaped you as a doctor. This type of narrative would better meet the guidelines of this section of the journal.

COMMENTS TO EDITOR II: I'm afraid I am going to recommend reject. Although the author made a sincere effort to rewrite this essay, I'm afraid that further rewrites will simply not bring it up to the level of insight desired. The two reviews were both fairly negative. They highlighted a "rambling, generic" style of writing (reviewer 2) as well as "fragmented" and unfocused. The paper does not really provide sufficient insight into how physicians evaluate and deal with racism whether subtle or explicit. It also, despite explicit feedback the first time around, does not really tell a story, therefore is not personal or particular. As one reviewer said, what we look for is an essay where, after reading, we say "I never thought about it quite like that before." Unfortunately that does not happen here.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR II: Thank you for revising this essay. Unfortunately, it still does not have sufficient narrative depth to warrant publication. The issue of patient racism and bias - whether explicit or subtle - is a complex one, and this discussion does not have the nuance or particularity rooted in your own experience that we would like to see. We recognize how challenging this can be with the word limit imposed by this section. We do appreciate your sharing your reflections.